Some Thoughts on Policies for the IEEE Trans. IT

Helmut Bőlcskei

ETH Zurich

BoG Meeting

June 2010
Thanks to

- E. Biglieri
- P. Bühlmann, EiC Annals of Statistics
- H. G. Feichtinger, EiC JFAA
- F. Kschischang
- V. Poor
The journal has 2 EiCs

EiC returns papers that are out of scope or exceedingly poorly written (grammar/spelling/clarity)

EiC sometimes rejects papers that are within scope because s/he finds it uninteresting

Papers that get a “revise and resubmit” decision are papers that we eventually want to see in the journal
AE scans assigned paper very carefully, sending the paper out for review means that it already passed a first threshold.

Annals have rejection rate of 70%, half of the papers are fast-rejected by the AEs (within 2-3 weeks upon submission).

EiC monitors AEs and “offers help” if necessary

AEs that show consistently poor performance are discharged from service.
Some Ideas for Trans. IT
Some Ideas

- AEs that work in academia should be tenured
- AEs can be discharged from service
- Special effort to reappoint senior people that may have already served as AEs, first successes (Jim Massey, Yossi Steinberg)
Some Ideas Cont’d

- Reviews that take a long time and are of poor quality are to be avoided under all circumstances

- Training session at ISIT and editorial meeting to discuss state of affairs

- Find out what is going on with productions process at IEEE
Working on tailoring the system for our needs, help from A. Wijngaarden

Will soon need a handful of AEs to test the setup

We get great help from Sonal Parikh at IEEE
Transition to Scholar One Cont’d

- System flags actions, if AE does not take action by a certain deadline system sends automated message
- Provision for special issues
- Paper scheduling
- AEs can set review deadlines by hand
Proposal for an Executive Editorial Board (EEB)
EEB: Main Principles

- 5 senior and highly recognized people in the field

- Appointed by BoG on a rotating basis out of synch with EiC, one new member each year (and one member rotating off)

- One of the EEB members designated to fill in for EiC should that be necessary

- EEB is not (only) a collection of notables in the field, but works closely with the EiC on a regular basis
EEB: Tasks

- Identifying candidates for AE positions and pre-screening them
- Help AEs that consistently underperform
- Decide on whether an AE that consistently underperforms should be discharged
- Dealing with plagiarism cases
- Handle appeals and authors’ complaints
Help in fast-rejecting papers

Help in handling papers at large

Help in identifying topics and potential authors for tutorial/survey/condensation papers

Help in identifying papers for paper awards

Help in identifying topics and guest editors for special issues